

WHAT ONCE WAS

Nathan Glazer—Merit Before Meritocracy

3(7(5 6.(55<

7KH SHUDPEXODWLQJ SDWK RI WKLV VRQ RI K
\$PHULFDĪV LQWHOOFWXDO DQG SROLWLFDO
RYHUFRPHĪDQG ORVWĪRYHU WKH SDVW FHQW

T KH GHDWK RI 1DWKDQ *ODJHU LQ -DGE~~LDJWK~~ODRRK
EHHQ ULJKWO\ QRWHG DV WKH HQG RI DQ HUD L
LQWHOOFWXDO OLIH 1DW *ODJHU ZDV WKH ODVW
/DVFK ZRXOG UHIHU WR DV D ŃVRFLDO W\SHÒ WKH
GDXJKWHUV RI LPSRYHULVKHG DOPRVW H[FOXVLYH
DGYDQWDJH RI WKH FLW\ĪV SXEOLF HGXFDWLRQ V\
DQG SROLWLFDO IHUPHQW WKDW IURP WKH ĪV L
OHDGLQJ PHWURSROLV RI WKH IUHH ZRUOG \$V *OD
SROHPLFV WKDW KH DQG KLV IHOORZ VWXGHQWV D
WKHP XQLTXH LQVLJKWV LQWR DQG XQDQWLFLSDW
FRPPXQLVP WR WKH UHVW RI \$PHULFD GXULQJ WKH

FRPSHWLQJ IRU DWWHQWLRQ DQG GRPLQDQFH 7KL
ZRXOG DJUHH ZLWK VXFK YLHZV PHUHO\ WKDW KH
FRQVLGHUDWLRQ DV KH VLIWHG DQG UHVLIWHG WK
ZKDW VHHPHG QHFHVVDU\ IRU WKH EURDGHU SXEO
HQYLVLRLQ KLP HYHU LQYRNLQJ VXFK DQ DEWUDFW

6XFK TXDOLWLHV GLG QRW PHDQ WKDW 1DW *ODJH
:KLOH KH ZDV LQYDULDEO\ UHVSQRVLYH DQG KHOS
IULHQGV WKHUH ZDV DERXW KLP DQ DLU RI GLVWU
FRXOG EH GLIILFXOW WR SLQ GRZQ +H HYLQFHG D
DUURJDQFH EXW SUHRFFXSDWLRQ ZLWK KLV RZQ W
EXW QRW MXVW DERXW KLP 3HUKDSV WKH EHVW GI
PXFZ ZRUNLQJ FODVV KRXLQJ LQ %ULWDLQIMXVW
DWWUDFW KLV DOPRVW FKLOGOLNH HQWKXVLDVP D

:KDW WKRVH RI XV IRUWXQDWH HQRXJK WR KDYH N
ZKDW 6DQGUD)DLOV KLV OLYH LQ FDUHWDNHU GX
ÑJHVW IRU OLIH Ò :KHWKHU IRU P\ ZLIHV VDYRU\ %
FKLFNHQ GLVK RI KLV RZQ PDNLQJERQWKIGDRFIRUVD
UHFHQWO\ XQH DUWKHG ERRN DERXW (JUD 3RXQG I
VWXGHQW KDYLQJ GLIILFXOW\ ILQGLQJ KLV \$LFKH
*HQWOHPDQ L@URRBRZQ DUWLFOH DERXW7,OG 1BZU
<RUNHU

N

DUPHQW :RUNHUV 8QLRQ ,/:8 :LWK KLV FKDUDF'
VHUHQGLSLWRXV *OD]HU RQFH VSHFXODWHG WKDV
XQLRQ ZRXOG KDYH EHHQ GRPLQDWHG E\ FRPPXQL'
DQG E\ H[WHQVLRQ 1DWÍZRXOG KDYH OLNHO\ EHHQ

,Q WKDW HUD \RXQJ SHRSOH IURP VXFK KXPEOH EI
FROOHJH KDG PRGHVW RU LOO GHILQH DPELWLRQ
SHHUV DW &LW\ &ROOHJH DQWLFLSDWHG FDUHHUV
PRUH WKDQ D GHFDGH RI HFRQRPLF GHSUHVVRQ I
Ñ:KR GUHDPHG RI DQ\ MRE H[FHSW D JRYHUQPHQW
DSSDUHQWO\ PRUH LOO GHILQH WKDQ PRVW 8QOI
JRW WR NQRZ RQ WKH VXEZD\ RQ WKHLU ZD\ WR &L
VRFLRORJ\ LQ WKH KRSH WKDW LW ZRXOG OHDG D
DV D VRFLDO ZRUNHU 1HLWKHU *OD]HU QRU /LSVH
OHDG WR ZLOGO\ VXFFHVVIXO DFDGHPLF FDUHHUV
FROOHDJXHV ILUVW DW %HUNHOH\ DQG WKHQ ODW

7KXV \RXQJ 1DW ZDQGHUHG IURP PDMRU WR PDMRI
SXEOLF DGPLQLVWUDWLRQÍXQWLO KH ILQDOO\ VHW
ODFNHG GLUHFWLRQ \$ FULWLFDO MXQFWXUH ZDV I
VWXGHQW ZKR KDG JUDGXDWHG IURP &LW\ &ROOHJ
HYHQWXDOO\ WDXJKW HFRQRPLFV DW &ROXPELD DC
DFWLYLVW DQG FULWLF RI \$PHULFDĪV ÑSHUPDQHQV

%XW ZKHQ WKH\ PHW 0HOPDQ ZDV D =LRQLVW DFW
=HOOLJ +DUULV D \RXQJ DFDGHPLF DW WKH 8QLYH
VRRQ WR HVWDEOLVK WKH ILUVW PRGHUQ OLQJXLV
+DUULV VXEVTXHQWO\ JDLQH ZRUOG UHQRZQ DV
IDPH RI D VRUW DV WKH WHDFKHU RI 1RDP &KRPVN

+DUULV ZDV DOVR WKH OHDGHU RI D VHOI VW\OHG
ZKR VH YLVLRQ IRU 3DOHVWLQH ZDV QRW D -HZLVK
VRFLDOLVW IHGHUWLRQ RI \$UDEV DQG -HZV 7KH
7RUFK WKH \RXWK DILOLDWH RI WKH =LRQLVW 2L
ORQJ \RXQJ *OD]HU \$DYNZRUMLQGHQW \$FWLRQ

GRFWRUDWH LQ DQWKURSRORJ\ DW 3HQQ KH ZDV
GLIIHUHQW PHQWRU QRW +DUULV ZKR DSSDUHQW
KDYH D GLIILFXOW WLPH SXUVXLQJ DQ DFDGHPLF F

"A QG VR , UHWXUQHG WR 1HZ <RUN WR ORRN IRU
LQ WKRVH GD\V DQG LQ WKRVH FLUFOHV WKH
H[SODLQHG WR PH ZDV N'DQ %HOO ZKR NQHZ HYH
VRFLDOLVW EXW VWDXQHQ\ DQMLG RZPPXQG VHF RPH
OLIH ORQJ IULHQG IXWXUH FROOHDJXH DW WKH +I
HGLWRU\RXEOLF DQGHUHLVWKERU LQ WKH)UDQFLV \$
RI &DPEULGJH %HOO FRQQHFVHG *ODJHU WR WKH
+RUNKHLPHU ZKR KDG MXVW EHHQ KLUHG E\ WKH \$
UHVHDFK DQWL 6HPLWLVP %XW KH ZDV +RUNKHLP
VKRUW WLPH DQG VRRQ PRYHG DOPRVW OLWHUDC
SXEOLF DQWL RQWHP SRUDU\ -HZLVK 5HFRUG

\$V WKH ZDU LQ (XURSH DQG WKHQ LQ WKH 3DFLILF
&-5,Q 1RYHPEHU LW J&RPPHODVLFK HODDU DV
HGLWRULDO DVVLVWDQW +H ZDV WDVNHG ZLWK KL
ODQ Ò ZKLFK DIIRUGHG KLP D SODWIRUP WR UHYLH
VRFLDO VFLHQFH OLWHUDWXUH WKDW VRXJKW WR
WKH DJH RI 1DWKDQ *ODJHU IRXQG KLPVHOI SUH
WKH PRVW FRQVHTXHQLDO RSLQLRQ MRXUQDO LQ
WKH WZHQWLHWK FHQWXU\

'XULQJ WKLW VDPH SHULRG *ODJHU ZDV DOVR D SD
VRFLRORJ\ DW &ROXPELD ZKHUH IRU D WXLWLRQ F
WKUHH FUHGLW OHFWXUH FRXUVHV WKDW PHW ODV
D ZHHN 7KXVH ZHUH DWWHQGHG E\ PDQ\ LQGLYLG
GHJUHHV RU SXUVXHG FDUHHUV LQ VRFLRORJ\ EX\
OHFWXUHV E\ WKH OLNHV RI 3DXO /D]DUVIHOG 5RE
*ODJHU KDG DSSOLHG IRU D IHOORZVKLS DQG EHHQ
DSSDUHQWO\ QR JUHDW VKDPH LQ WKDW VLQFH JU
VRFLRORJ\ DW &ROXPELD ZHUH VR ORRVHO\ VWUXF

,W ZDV DOVR DURXQG WKLW WLPH WKDW 'DQLHO %H
5LHVDPQ ZKR ZDV WKHQ KHDGLQJ XS DQ XQGHUJU
WKH 8QLYHUVLW\ RI &KLFDJR %HOO ZDV WHDFKLQ
QRWLRQ WKDW KH PLJKW EH LQWHUHVWHG LQ GRLO
SODQV IRU KLP)DPLOLDU Z&RPPHODVLFK HODDU
KLP WR ZRUN RQ D UHVHDFK SURMHFW DERXW SRV
FXOPLQDWHG LQ ZLWK WKH RQXODVLRQ RQIDP
OLVWHG RQ WKH FRYHU DORQJ ZLWK 5LHVDPQ\V DG
ZDV DW WKH DJH RI WZHQW\ VHYHQ FRDXWKRU RI I
LPPHGLDWH VXFFHVV EXW HYHQWXDOO\ RQH RI WK
VFLHQFH VWXGLHV LQ \$PHULFDQ KLVWRU\ <HW LW
REWDLQHG KLV GRFWRUDWH LQ VRFLRORJ\ IURP &F

,Q ZKHQ *ODJHU P&RPPHODVLFK HODDU ZDV QRW WR D W
UHVHDFK SRVW DW D XQLYHUVLW\ EXW WR WKH S
WKHUH E\ WKH \RXQJ -DVRQ (SVWHLQ ZKR ZDV MXV
WKH ILUVW DWWHPSW LQ WKH 8QLWHG 6WDWHV WR
3HQJXLQ %RRNV LQ WKH 8QLWHG .LQJGRP 1HHGOH
DQG ZHQW RQ WR IXUWKHU VXFFHVV DQG UHQRZQ
+RXVH

%XW WKH VWRU\ DERXW (SVWHLQ WKDW 1DW PRVW
GLIIHUHQW SXEOLVKLQJ YHQWXUH ,Q WKH PLGGOH
VWULNH LW ZDV (SVWHLQ\V EXVLQHVV DFXPHQ WKI
SROLWLFDO OLWHUDU\ PDJD]LQH WKDW KDG ORQJ

%DUEDUD DORQJ ZLWK HGLWRU 5REHUW 6LOYHUV
KXVEDQG SRHW 5REHUW/RZHOO .QRZLQJ ILUVW K
GXULQJ WKH VWULNH WR SXEOLFLJH WKHLU WLWOH
DGYHUWLVLQJ GROODUVÍQRW D JUDQW IURP D IRX
SURYLGH WKH ILQDQFLQJ QHHGHG WR70BX1QFZK <R K P
5HYLHZ RI7%FRUNHW LV SXEOLVKLQJ KLVWRU\

:KLOH DW 'RXEOHGD\ *ODJHU ZDV FRPPLVLRQHG E
JLYH D VHULHV RI OHFWXUHV DW WKH 8QLYHUVLVW\
WRSLF WKDW KLV LQYROYHFRPPWZLWUO =SURSLVPHG
7KLV ZDV WKH JHQHVL\$PHULFDQ -SERRQG WKLW WL
*ODJHU SDUWLFLSDWHG LQ D)RUG)RXQGDWLRQ IX
LQIOXHGFH RI FRPPXQLVP LQ \$PHULFD 'XULQJ WKH
WHDFKLQJ IXOO WLPH RQH \HDU VWLQWV DW YDUL
%HUNHOH\ %HQQLQJWRQ DQG 6PLWK ZKHUH KH P
VHFRQG DQG VXUYLYLQJ ZLIH +H VWLOO GLG QRV
RI KLV ROG &LW\ &ROOHJH IULHQG ODUW\ /LSVHW
*ODJHU PDQDJHG WR PDLQWDLQ KLV WLHV WR WKH
KLV ERRN IURP WKHFRB\$DMMHFWLV RI \$PDMFDQ
SXEOLVKHG 7KH IROORZLQJ \HDU LW ZDV VXEPLWV
KLP DV KH ODWHU ZURWH ÑDW WKH DJH RI D I
WR EH RQH Ò

,W ZDV GXULQJ WKLW VDPH SHULRG WKDW *ODJHU Z
WR ÑEHFRPH DQ H[SHUW RQ -DSDQ Ò \$IWHU DQ LQI
RIILFHU DW WKH)RUG)RXQGDWLRQ KH ZDV WROG
SODQQHG WR VWXG\ WKHUH +H GLG VR H[SODLQL
7RN\R E\ OLYLQJ LQ 7RN\R WKH ZD\ , KDG OHDUQH
1HZ <RUN Ò 7KH IRXQGDWLRQIV UHVSQRVH" Ñ, ZDV
ILUVW FODVV DLUIDUH ZLWKRXW KDYLQJ WR WURX
UHFRPPHQGDWLRQ Ò KH ODWHU UHFRXQWHG ÑDW
SRVLWLRQ LQ WKH 8QLWHG 6WDWHV DQG ZLWKRXV
DIILOLDWLRQ LQ -DSDQ Ò 7KLV ZDV DOO YHU\ IHOL
QR -DSDQHVH \$V KH ULJKWO\ FRQFOXGHG Ñ+RZ J
IRXQGDWLRQV LQ Ò

8SRQ KLV UHWXUQ IURP D FKDVWHQLQJ \HDU LQ -D

T

UHVXOW LQ D YLRODWLRQ RI WKH ULJKWV RI WKRV
7KHQ RI FRXUVH VWXGHQWV KDYH WKHLU RZQ UL
XQGHUJUDGXDWLV WR SULYDF\ H[WHQGV WR WKHL
ZKLFK WKHLU SDUHQWV DUH QRW SHUPLWWHG DFFI
WKH ELOOV %XW XQGHU WKH SHUYHUVH ORJLF QR
VWXGHQWV QRW WKH SDUHQWV DUH WKH ÑFXVWRI
VHUYHG ZKLFK QHFHVVDULO\ PHDQV WKDW WKH D>
JHW FLUFXPV FULEHG 8QWLO UHFHQWO\ WKH SRLG
WHDFK WKH \RXQJ ZKDW WKH\ QHHG WR NQRZ LQ R
DERXW WKHLU OLYHV 'RQH SURSHUO\ WKLV PHDQ'
DQG DXWKRULW\ WR SUHVLGH RYHU WKH YDULHG R
LQIRUPDO OHDUQLQJ QHFHVVDU\ WR DFFRPPRGDWI
IURP DGROHVFHQFH WR DGXOWKRRG 7RGD\ KRZH'
GLUHFVV VWXGHQWV GRZQ SDWKV WKDW DUH HYHL
QDUURZ 7KH RQO\ JURXQG OHIW XSRQ ZKLFK IDFX
RI FDUHHU FRXQVHORU DQG WUDLQHU \$QG WKLV L
RI VWXGHQWV DQG WKHLU SDUHQWV ZLWK SODQL
DFFXPXODWHG WR SD\ IRU WKH YDULRXV ÑHGXF
SHUVXDGHG WR FRQVXPH

VWXGHQWV ZKR KDG EHHQ LQWHUYLHZLQJ IDUPZRU
GLQQHU FRPSDQLRQV HODERUDWHG DW OHQJWK RC
ZRUNHUV EXW FRXOG WHOO PH QRWKLQJ DERXW W
JRDOV RI WKHLU XQLRQLJDWLRQ HIIRUWV

7R EH VXUH WKHUH LV D SROLWLFDO YDOHQFH WR
QRW EH PXFK GLIIHUHQW LI FRQWHPSRUHU\ VRFLD
FRQVHUYDWLYHV *LYHQ WKH EDVLF G\QDPLFV RI W
FRQVHUYDWLYH VRFLDO VFLHQWLWV ZRXOG EH D
KRZ WKHLU SURIHVVLRQDO DVSLUDWLRQV DQG QRU
ÍWR XQGHUVWDQG DQG DQDO\JH VRFLDO FXOWXUD
FRQWHPSRUHU\ \$PHULFD 7KH ULVH RI WKH 7HD 3D
'RQDOG 7UXPS VXJJHVW WKDW FRQVHUYDWLYH DFD
MRXUQDOLVP DQG DW WKLQN WQNV DUH MXVW DV
DVVHVVLQJ WKH FKDOOHQJHV FRQIURQWLQJ PDQ\ \$

,W LV FULWLFDO KHUH WR SRLQW RXW WKH VLJQLI
XQLYHUVLWLHV SUHVHQW WKHPVHOYHV WR WKH ZL
WHQG WR EHKDYH DPRQJ WKHPVHOYHV ,Q PXFK RI
XQLYHUVLWLHV WKH GRPLQDQW WRQH LV RQH RI D
WKH DFDGHP\ WKH GD\ WR GD\ OLYHG UHDOLW\ L

Y

SUHV LGHQWLDQ FDPSDLJQ SURPLVHV WR EH QR PR
\$V SRZHU DQG LQIOXHQFH KDYH EHHQ DPDVVHG LQ
GLVFRXUVH KDV VKLIWHG IURP XQREWUXVLYH MRFI
LQWHUHVWV WR QRLV\ GHEDWHV RYHU SXEOLF JRD
VKDUH RI DWWHQWLRQ DQG UHVRXUFHV JRLQJ WR
SROLF\ REMHFWLYHV ,Q -DPHV 4 :LOVRQ REV
FRXQWV QRZ DUH LGHDV PRUH WKDQ LQWHUHVWV Ć
KDG GLVDSSHDUHG PFK OHVV WKDW WKH LGHDV
FRKHUHQW 2QH FRQVHTXHQFH RI WKHVH GHYHORS
YLVLELOLW\ RI WKLQN WDNV ZKLFK WRGD\ VHHP
ÑPHVVDJLQJ Ò 0RUH WR WKH SRLQW WKRVH ZKR W
EHOLHYH WKH\ KDYH LQWHUHVWV \$QG WKRVH ZLW
:KDWĪV PLVVLQJ IURP WKLV WDEOHDX DUH LQWHOO
VXUYLYLQJ LQ WKH PDUNHWSODFH :DVKLQJWRQ W
-DVRQ (SVWHLQ ZRXOG LGHQWLI\ D EXVLQHVV RSSI
EURZ SXEOLFDWLRQ DQG ZLQG XS PDNLQJ 1HZH\ F
<RUN 5HYBUZZRXOG DQ ,UYLQJ .ULVWRO VWDUW D :

